

Although Wallerstein does not see communism as an alternative, he still believes that socialism may be (p. 31). Despite this, he believes that the left will have to go through a radical transformation, i.e. it will have to depart from its anti-systemic stand because an alternative politics cannot be anti-systemic with the 'system, if not in ruin, at least in disarray' (p. 187). Moreover, the left also lacks 'structural foundation' (p. 186). To be an alternative and remain relevant, Wallerstein argues, the left will have 'to construct a 'broad-front' sort of movement' (p. 72). And so far as the future of the world-system analysis in the uncertain world is concerned, he believes that in future this perspective will 'end up conquering the intellectual world', and that it would be possible only when scholars start thinking about 'new historical social sciences' (p. 26). Wallerstein is of the firm belief that once the process begins, world-system analysis will become 'a constitutive part of the historical social sciences' (p. 25); and consequently, 'the existence of a perspective known as world-system analysis won't make any sense' (p. 26).

Despite its seeming like a reproduction of Wallerstein's earlier works, the book is distinct in several senses. Instead of touching on every aspect of his writings in detail, it provides a thematic overview of his works, the origins of his concepts and ideas, and the ways in which he has modified them, if required, to suit his arguments. Thus the book can help readers to understand the development of his thought in its proper context. However, perhaps the most important contribution of the book is its evaluative aspect: how and to what extent his ideas and concepts are relevant today. Since he has been writing for the last six decades, with the first ground-breaking work coming around four decades ago, Wallerstein's works are clearly of importance, and has made a significant contribution to social science. Consequently, it has become necessary to bring his ideas together and evaluate their usefulness in the current context of a changing international system and by addressing that lacuna, this book eloquently serves the cause.

### Author biography

Vikash Chandra is a Ph.D. candidate at the Centre for International Politics, Organisation and Disarmament, School of International Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi.

---

Wolfgang Fritz Haug, Frigga Haug, Peter Jehle and Wolfgang Küttler (eds.)  
*Historisch-kritisches Wörterbuch des Marxismus, Band 8/II (Historical-Critical Dictionary of Marxism)*, Berliner Institut für kritische Theorie, InkriT, Argument-Verlag Hamburg, 2015; 888 pp: 9783886194414, €98

**Reviewed by** Jörn Janssen,  
*Institut Europeen du Salarariat and Denknetz*

This review needs to be embedded as a brief reference to the whole project of which this particular volume is just a component part. The *Historical-Critical Dictionary of Marxism* was founded in 1983, commemorating 100 years from Karl Marx's death. The first volume, edited by Wolfgang Fritz Haug, was published in 1994 and, according to the preface of the present volume, it may take another 20 years to accomplish the planned 15 volumes. The dictionary is now published under the editorial team of Wolfgang Fritz

Haug, Frigga Haug, Peter Jehle and Wolfgang Küttler. The project is based at the Berliner Institut für kritische Theorie (InkriT), founded in 1996 as a scientific institution at the Freie Universität Berlin. Since Volume 6, each number has consisted of two books, so we may expect the whole series to encompass 25 books of about 1,000 pages. More than 800 scholars are cooperating in this gigantic and ambitious project. A clue to the inspiration and fundamental concept of this dictionary, or rather encyclopaedia, can be found in the entry on 'Marxismus' by Wolfgang Fritz Haug in the present volume. It reflects on the final stage of Comecon state socialism as a social formation claiming to have implemented the principles of Marx's legacy after the Soviet Revolution. In Germany, a young generation of eminent scholars, having embraced communism or socialism under the auspices of Karl Marx as a movement of liberation from fascist capitalism, started rethinking their political background after the collapse of the students' revolt and the 'reform' programme of the GDR under Erich Honecker. Wolfgang Fritz Haug and Frigga Haug, the best known figures among the founders of the *Dictionary*, typically represent the generation which embarked on this 'historical-critical' rethink of Marx's legacy and its diverse ramifications.

The most recent Volume 8/II, published in 2015, covers 75 entries between '*links/rechts*' (left/right) and '*Maschinenstürmer*' (machine-breakers), almost all of them written by different authors, sometimes more than one, but with no less than seven entries by Wolfgang Fritz Haug alone. Most striking at a first glance is the wide scope and variety of subjects. Besides core issues of Marxism, such as '*Linksozialismus*' (left socialism), '*Lohnarbeit*' (wage labour), '*Lucács-Schule*', '*Luxemburgismus*', '*Marxismus*' etc., entries under '*Luxus*', '*Machiavellismus*', '*Märchen*' (fairy tales), '*Marktfrauen*' (market-women) etc. are much less obvious. This diversity corresponds with the wide range of theoretical approaches represented by the individual authors, from, on the one hand, adhering to strict orthodoxy, such as Michael Krädtke on '*Lohnform*' (wage form), to, on the other, contributions in which Marx is neither quoted nor even mentioned, such as Ruth May on '*Marktfrauen*'. Each entry is written as an essay in its own right, with its own often very extensive bibliography and references to other entries. The whole book consists of 888 pages, not accounting for the extensive appendices. The longest entry I found by Wolfgang Fritz Haug on '*Marxistsein/Marxistinsein*' (male/female being a Marxist) covered 62 pages, whilst the average length of the entries is about 12 pages. More than 200 individuals have contributed to 'The financing of one or more pages of this volume' (p. v).

At first sight, this dictionary compares with other compendia of knowledge or dictionaries of language, history, scientific disciplines etc. in size and appearance. It will fill a large shelf in a living room, study, or library, with 11 books to date, and 25 in the foreseeable future, divided by entries in alphabetical order, perhaps side by side with the *Encyclopaedia Britannica*. But, like *Britannica*, it is confined to one language only: German, rather than English. Nevertheless, many entries are written by non-German authors and translated into German, and a considerable number of entries are published in English by 'Historical Materialism' (<http://neu.inkrit.de/index.php/en/hcdm/articles>) – further translations are available in Spanish and Turkish. After all, Marx spent the major part of his life in Britain, and analysed capitalism as a global economic regime rooted in England. Also, Marxism as a school of thought and political inspiration as well as a movement was and is international to all intents and purposes.

In contrast with its unilingual limitation, the collection's scientific scope is virtually universal. It covers philosophy, history, sociology, economics, politics, ethnology, literature and more. This transdisciplinary approach is one of its main strengths, whilst the breadth of scientific perspective is by no means at the expense of depth. The bibliographies are especially a powerful testimony to the level of scholarship and thorough research in the exploration of each individual subject. This level of scholarship is achieved to a large extent by InkriT's seminars, organised to discuss the subjects in the dictionary. Each entry can well be perceived like an argument in a debate.

How can these compendia be read and digested? They do not readily lend themselves to checking up gaps in knowledge in conversations. Nor can we read them like books from cover to cover. But they can certainly be helpful as a resource in scientific research. Also, they can be very attractive for reading selected entries as short essays – ideal, for instance, for bedtime.

But there is another aspect relating to the origin and, perhaps, purpose of the project. Marx's legacy offers a message of how to defeat human exploitation under the rule of capitalism. Thus the dictionary aims to provide the critique of capitalism as a tool in the campaign for a just and equal society based on labour instead of capital. However, given the diversity and even controversies in the interpretation of this message based on the theory of surplus value, Marxism has ceased to unite a community around this campaign. The dictionary is a document to this process of diversification in a changing global society, which does not mean that capitalism is going to survive.

At any rate, the dictionary ought to be available at least in public libraries across the globe for all those who are able to read it, and in the British Library, in the first instance.

### Author biography

Jörn Janssen is a member of the European Institute for Construction Labour Research, L'Institut Européen du Salarariat, and Denknetz.

---

Renzo Llorente (trans. and ed.)

*The Marxism of Manuel Sacristán: From Communism to the New Social Movements*, Brill, Leiden and Boston, 2014; 312 pp: 9789004223554, €119 (hbk)

**Reviewed by** Ian J. Seda-Irizarry,  
City University of New York, USA

The Portuguese writer and Nobel Prize winner José Saramago once famously said, 'writers make national literature, while translators make universal literature' – a statement that nicely captures what Renzo Llorente has accomplished for the international Marxist tradition with his book *The Marxism of Manuel Sacristán: From Communism to the New Social Movements* (TMMS hereon). Llorente, a professor of philosophy at the Madrid campus of Saint Louis University, has translated and compiled a list of twenty pieces, made up of articles and interviews by arguably the most important Spanish Marxist philosopher of the 20th century, Manuel Sacristán (1925-1985). Until this publication